Twice-Told Narratives in "Alice Doane's Appeal": The Moment When the Form of Romance was Generated

Mamiko KOMIYAMA

Introduction: Bridging the "Two Hundred and Eighteen Years" Gap

On July 7th 1853, Nathaniel Hawthorne and his family departed from Boston harbor on the steamship Niagara to Liverpool in England, where he had been appointed to the position of the new United States consul for this port. Fifteen months after his landing, on October 9th 1854, Hawthorne commented on his affinity with his ancestors' homeland in his The English Notebooks:

> My ancestor left England in 1630. I return in 1853. I sometimes feel as if I myself had been absent these two hundred and eighteen years [sic] – leaving England just emerging from the feudal system, and finding it on the verge of Republicanism. It brings the two far separated points of time very closely together, to view the matter thus. (*XXI* 138)[1]

It is interesting that he adopts the verb "return" instead of "moving" to express his transfer to England. Considering that this was his first visit to Europe, it would have been appropriate enough to use "move" or "cross" the actual space for traveling. However, by using "return," it is as if Hawthorne had identified with his first ancestor who left England for the New World in 1630. By crossing the Atlantic from the American continent and standing on the fatherland, his substantial body seemed to leap in time and space in order to bridge the two separated points of time and fill the gap of "two hundred and eighteen years," which is the inverse orientation of the ancestral Puritans' dream. Finally, although he could "return" to his ancestral origins physically, in his works Hawthorne always managed to find a more effective way to depict the separation of time and space, especially in order to appeal to his contem-

porary readers.

Nathaniel Hawthorne, one of the representative writers of mid-nineteenth-century America, is particularly conscious about the early colonial history of his native New England. His treatment of the past is to weave historical facts and materials into a plot and develop imaginary tales in his narrative space. In other words, Hawthorne retells another version of history in his works. From his early tales focused on the colonial period to the unfinished English romances in the late years, he repeatedly drew on the Puritan past to construct his narratives. This writing style of combining historical sources into his content, has been widely recognized as Hawthorne's prominent characteristic. This is exemplified in his early tales such as "My Kinsman, Major Molineux" (1832), which focuses on the unsettled conditions between the British colonial government and the first generation born in the American continent around the 1730s; "Young Goodman Brown" (1835) set in Salem at the time of William III (who reigned from 1689 to 1702), which deals with Puritan social piety and its hidden depravity; and "Roger Malvin's Burial" (1832), which is based on the historical battle in 1725[2] between frontier Indians and colonial farmers known as Lovell's Fight. Needless to say, his masterpiece *The Scarlet Letter* (1850) takes place in the Puritan society in the seventeenth-century and its main characters are the first generation of English-origin settlers.

Considering the fact that Hawthorne had treated the New England past as his source material, his narratives, as his romances, always retell another version of history in a fictional form. It was not uncommon to adopt the colonial past as material for creating fiction at that time, and such works using this prominent feature have been referred to as 'romance' ever since.[3] While Hawthorne adopted the technique of romance in his works and retold the historical events as his fictional version, there seem to be different patterns of "retelling" in his romances. One way is to use historical materials as a source of his narrative and integrate them into the fictional story as exemplified in this early section. A second technique is to retell his tales which first appeared

in magazines and were later published as a collection of short stories. A third pattern is to revise the original work in order to reconstruct a new version. In this way, Hawthorne's romance provides various levels of the "retelling" style, which makes his works even more attractive to readers, not only for his contemporaries but also for later generations. I shall now examine his various "retell" styles to discuss this conscious or unconscious characteristic of Hawthorne's style of romance in mid-nineteenth-century America, at the threshold of the period in which many writers sought to establish their original form of writing in the space of America.

1. Romance as a Self-generating Power

The theory of romance that Hawthorne introduced in his famous preface of his second novel *The House of the Seven Gables* (1851) has been most frequently quoted when we consider the difference between "romance" and "novel." Before starting the story, he presented his definition in order for his work to be recognized and accepted by his readers not as a traditional novel but as a "romance." To begin with, we shall reaffirm Hawthorne's claim about the style of romance described in his preface and see how he tried to adapt it to his narrative. By comparing the Novel's characteristic of "a very minute fidelity" to man's experience and degree of its reliability, the narrator claims "a certain latitude" in the style of "Romance" as follows:

> The former [a Romance] … has fairly a right to present that truth under circumstances, to a great extent, of the writer's own choosing or creation. If he think fit, also, he may so manage his atmospherical medium as to bring out or mellow the lights and deepen and enrich the shadows of the picture. (*II* 1)

Here, Hawthorne in the voice of narrator claims "a right" of a certain amount of freedom when the writer creates his narrative as a romance, in much the same way as a painter draws a picture selecting one motif and shedding a special light on it. This way of portrait is free from the restriction that the

general novel has required, such as a sense of verisimilitude to reality. Under such imaginary ground, the writer could represent the truth by imbuing a kind of actuality in his work, and this is what Hawthorne has declared to claim in his romance style. Whereas, of course, Hawthorne must have had no idea that his definition of romance would be discussed over a long period and accepted as one of the representative literary forms, his concept of romance has become a certain criterion when we consider its function and effect in American literary history.

According to Nina Baym, "romance" is a distinct and defining American fictional form. It therefore it has been "a concept indispensable for constructing a cannon of major works", and the romance category has become "a significant criterion for inclusion or exclusion" when people analyze the fictions (Baym 426).[4] Moreover, "to look in literature for the essence of 'the American experience' was necessarily to seek for something that could be found in the literature of no other nation," and this very "something" must be a form to identify its nationality. It might have been difficult to find "the American experience" since this country's history was actually a relatively short one and there was scarce material in both social and cultural fields compared to the Old World (Baym 427). For that reason, the form of "romance," combining the imaginary elements with the real material, seemed appropriate for its nation, and that is why it has survived up to the present day holding its originality and acquiring a wide audience.

It was Richard Chase in his influential book of *The American Novel and it Tradition* (1957) that clearly differentiated the American novel from the British novel. Chase tried to assert that by incorporating an element of romance the earliest American novel with its "most original and characteristic form" has "worked out its destiny and defined itself." Approving the idea that the form of American novel had inevitably sprung from England, he insists that "American romance-novel" may be called "freer, more daring, more brilliant fiction" than the English novel. Moreover, it is different from the English tradition "by its perpetual reassessment and reconstitution of romance within the novel form" (Chase viii). This phrase could be interpreted as the genre

of romance having the spontaneous power of perpetual reassessment and reconstitution in the conventional novel form. In other words, romance has the innate ability of self-generating power within its style. Here, we should pay attention to Chase's word choice of "reassessment" and "reconstitution"; both of them include the prefix "re-" as in "back" or "again" (OED), which indicates the act of repetition. Since the words "re-assessment" and "re-constitution" signify its repetitive nature, the latest version of romance is the result of perpetual repetition. Of course, American romance does not incubate and reproduce the narrative by itself such as AI (artificial intelligence) could do in our time. The repeating, self-generating power within the romance is derived by readers through the social context in which they live. This process could be achieved only after readers in different periods reinterpret the narrative context. Every time they discover a new meaning in the text by reflecting on their society and its philosophy, the romance will be reconstructed over and over again. The form of American novel, or romance, seems to have such a spontaneous power within its formula.

On the other hand, there are some cases in which the author himself retouches his tales. One example is when the author revises the original version in accordance with the needs of society and creates an updated version. Another case is when the author republishes the tales a second or third time according to social or personal preference. Nathaniel Hawthorne employed both of these methods. In the former case, the original version of his early tale of "Alice Doane's Appeal" was later revised by following the advice of the editor. In the latter, Hawthorne published a collection of short stories entitled *Twice-Told Tales* that contained the tales which appeared in magazines before, which he then reprinted as new editions for three times within twenty years. The process of republishing makes it possible to have the chance of retelling the tales and acquiring a wider audience. Therefore, as the object to be interpreted, the form of romance has the potential to transform its style like updating the files through the occasional changes by the author. Romance thus obtains the unique capability to develop its form through the reading and judgement of various readers in different periods.

Another attempt to define writing a romance is related to the sense of time. Hawthorne confesses that the reason why he prefers naming his tales as 'romance' rather than 'novel' is that romance will "connect a by-gone time with the very Present that is flitting away from us" (*II* 2). Writing tales of the colonial period generates an inescapable distance in space and time: the distance between past and present, the seventeenth-century and mid-nineteenth century in the narrative space. According to Hawthorne, unlike historical writings or realistic novels, romance attains the right to make time change freely at the writer's discretion, and the readers are also permitted to accept it as an imaginary event (*II* 1-3). Therefore, he could put the historical material into his narratives and show it to contemporary readers in his romances, which contained an attempt to induce them to imagine their ancestral past, or reflect on the beginning of history in America. Trying to bridge the spatial and temporal distance, his narratives repeatedly retold the American past under the name of romance, and his romances have steadily acquired a wider range of readers and various interpretations over the years.

2. Twice-Told Narratives: Retelling, Revising, or Republishing the Original

The style of retelling narrative might remind us of the title of *Twice-Told Tales*, which is Hawthorne's first short story collection, published in 1837. In this section, I will focus on the term of "twice-told," and try to consider Hawthorne's habitual style of repeating the narratives.

Twice-Told Tales includes his early stories written in the 1830s, all of which first appeared in periodicals such as *The Token*, *United States Magazine and Democratic Review*, and *American Monthly Magazine*. Chronologically, this collection was published three times: the first edition was published in spring of 1837 by American Stationers' Company, the second version, to which twenty-one pieces were added, was published in two volumes in 1842, and finally the third edition appeared in 1851 with a short preface by Hawthorne.[5] Thus, including their first appearance in magazines and counting the updated versions, the tales collected in *Twice-Told Tales* appeared repeatedly in the

printed form not just twice but as many as four times within twenty years.

As for this peculiar title, many critics admitted that it was based on a line from William Shakespeare's *The Life and Death of King John* (Act III Sc. iv) spoken by the French Dauphin: "Life is as tedious as a twice-told tale, / Vexing the dull ear of a drowsy man" (Wineapple 92-93, Howe 5). According to the Oxford English Dictionary, the primary meaning of "twice-told" signifies the literal meaning as "counted or reckoned twice" and "narrated or related twice" (*OED* 1. 2.). Since then, the term of "twice-told" has come to be treated as equal to "tedious" by this playwright's arbitrary interpretation, and it is used as "hackneyed" in the figurative sense rather than as its literal meaning (Tatsumi 239). More importantly, what did Hawthorne intend when he employed this term in the title of his collection? In a letter to Longfellow when he sent him this collection just after its first publication —and marking the start of their friendly intercourse— he explained as follows:

> We were not, it is true, so well acquainted at college, that I can plead an absolute right to inflict my 'twice-told' tediousness upon you; but I have regretted that we were not better known to each other, and have been glad of your success in literature … The present volume contains such articles as seemed best worth offering to the public a second time; (XV 255)

Around this time, Longfellow had already achieved fame and acquired a wide audience for his books, so this might be one of the reasons why Hawthorne wrote this letter in such a strange, self-deprecatory tone. While seemingly, adopting a humble attitude, the reader might have noticed that Hawthorne used the term of "twice-told" both literally and figuratively here. At first, to ask Longfellow to read his book, he rephrased its title to "'twice-told' tediousness", while "tales" should be put in the place of "tediousness." Although initially remarking that his tales might be tedious for Longfellow, he unceremoniously revised his former remarks to state that his "second time" articles might be "best worth offering to the public." Thus, just after adopting "twice-told

[tales]" to mean "tediousness" as Shakespeare did, he negated it immediately and applied the original meaning of "narrated twice" to the re-publication of his first tales. Through these devices, even though all of his tales were retellings of magazine articles, it seems that Hawthorne tried to defend his second publishing of the tales from public prejudice by naming them "twice-told" in his title (Julian H 153).[6]

Even though the title was borrowed from a line of Shakespeare, there is a definitive difference between their meanings. In the Shakespeare line, "Life" is described as tedious as "a twice-told tale," so one man's life is compared to a twice-told tale. While Shakespeare uses the singular form as "a twice-told tale," what Hawthorne retold was a number of "tales" which had appeared separately in magazines. Furthermore, the book of *Twice-Told Tales* was updated twice more in 1842 and 1851. Even though this upgrade might have been mainly for economic reasons for Hawthorne and his family, this form of transition provided an opportunity for his works to be read continuously by the public. It was not a "tedious" way to retell the tales twice or more, as it was possible to present a chance for new meanings to be created by readers of the latest version.

Other than with the form of the book *Twice-Told Tales*, many of his works are associated with a style of "twice-told." It was Hawthorne's customary way to adopt colonial or historical material into his narrative, but he did not deal with them exclusively. In many cases, the first source of his narratives were legends, tradition or oral testimony. For example, with respect to the history of the contest for ownership of land between the Pyncheons and the Maules in *The House of the Seven Gables*, "no written record of this dispute is known to be in existence" and "acquaintance with the whole subject is derived chiefly from tradition" (*II* 7). The story of Hester Prynne in *The Scarlet Letter* was also based on "the verbal testimony of individuals" who had remembered her during her lifetime or "heard the tale from contemporary witnesses" (*I* 259-60). In spite of having a historical background, most of his narratives were based on tradition, and its unreliable authority freed his tales from the restrictions of following the historical facts. By introducing legends

and materializing them into his narratives, Hawthorne differentiated his tales from official history and opened a private narrative space in his romance.

While Chase concluded that American romance had disappeared and been replaced by modern realism at the end of the 19th century, he also saw the prospect that "the history of the American novel is not only the history of the rise of realism but also of the repeated rediscovery of the uses of romance, and that this will continue to be so" (Chase xii). He pointed out that American romance is not only a simple literary form but also the usage or tool to interpret something such as the reader's contemporary society. Thus, romance might have been re-used and new meanings continuously re-discovered in relation to the progress of society from its birth to the present day. Consequently, romance will update its meaning according to each social context and what readers may interpret in the literature in light of the anxieties underlying their community. Hawthorne reused historical sources, revised them in his romances and retold them to the public repeatedly. Thus, consciously or unconsciously, his romances outlived their historical sources, and acquired the possibility of being reinterpreted through various periods. "Twice-told" therefore seemed "best worth offering to the public" in the end.

3. "Alice Doane's Appeal": Reusing Urtext and the Emergence of the"Twice-Told" Form

One of the clearest examples of twice-told tale in Hawthorne's works was written as an initial study in his youth and later revised as the completed tale. To investigate the practical narrative style of "twice-told," I would like to examine one of his earliest short stories: "Alice Doane's Appeal." This tale first appeared in *The Token* in 1835, and had been omitted from any other Hawthorne collections during his lifetime. After being included in the Centenary edition in 1974, however, many critics have bitterly commented on its fragmentary structure, scattered episodes and lack of coherence. The reason for this barrage of criticism might be associated with the process of constructing its narrative structure. His sister Elizabeth testified that the original version had been written in 1825, the year of his graduation from

Bowdoin College, and that this version was intended to be included in his first collection *Seven Tales of My Native Land*, but he aborted the plan itself and abandoned some manuscripts because of the publishers' rejection (Waggoner 48-9).[7] Before Hawthorne submitted it to *The Token* in 1835, he revised and rewrote this urtext called "Alice Doane" as "Alice Doane's Appeal" following the advice of Samuel Griswold Goodrich, who was the editor of *The Token*. Muting inappropriate descriptions like evoking incest directly, he revised the tale in order to be accepted by the "genteel readers" of that magazine (Gross 232-36). At the same time, he reused the original parts as the inner tale and constructed the new version that we have in the present "Alice Doane's Appeal" (Brodwin 49). This is how this work incorporated the two tales and constructed the frame-structure. In the frame part, the narrator reads the inner story, which deals with incest and fratricidal murder, to the two young women represented as an audience on Gallows Hill where the historical event of witch trials occurred in 1692.

Having this format, many critics have tried to consider this narrative by differentiating the retold part from the reworked framework.[8] Frederick C. Crews, who read this tale through a psychoanalytic approach, extracted "three distinct plot-strands" that joined "ineptly and confusingly" from the whole narrative and suggested that they should be distinguished from the "surviving tale" (Crews 45). Here we should take note of the term that Crews used: "survive." As Hawthorne himself mentioned in the narrative, the original manuscripts actually escaped from being burned. This indicates that there is a time difference between the surviving tale and the reworked part of the narrative's frame. Since we can no longer obtain the full version of "Alice Doane," it is difficult to decide whether the revised version upgraded or downgraded the original. Looking through the surviving part, however, we can reach some clue of Hawthorne's intention in rescuing the original story of "Alice Doane." I agree with Waggoner's reproaches that the surviving fragments "do not justify the emphasis given by the title to Alice, who exists in the fragments merely as a name" (Waggoner 50), but rather we should consider that the title of "Alice Doane" represents not just a heroine's name

but a form of text. With the style of "twice-told," Hawthorne tried to make the text of "Alice Doane" survive and we might see what the author hoped to "appeal" in his revised narrative of "Alice Doane's Appeal."

What kinds of narrative had passed on to the updated version? Five extracted parts that seem to be quoted from the original are incorporated into three scenes. The first is when Leonard visited the wizard and confessed that he realized his strong affection for his sister Alice after becoming aware of his twin-brother Walter Brome's presence. The second is when Leonard murdered Walter, and the dead face reminded him of a likeness to their murdered father in the Indian attack when they were young. The third scene is when Leonard and Alice visited a graveyard at night where all the dead in Salem were buried, and witnessed a spectral pageant. All of the scenes that seem to have been extracted from the urtext are connected to the moment that both a small family unit and a large community rooted in the same ground are filled with shame. The most prominent feature is that these three scenes all relate back to Leonard's actions: after the murder by Leonard, their father's face from a generation before appeared on the dead face of Walter, and when Leonard and Alice visited a graveyard, they found the apparitions of every generation gathered there. This retrospective description suggested that the common elements of crime and sin have taken over, or have been inherited by people who were born and buried in the same soil.[9]

Then, the story moves from the inner tale to the outer frame. Returning to the external frame part, the narrator tries to redirect the two women's attention to the spot where they take a seat, Gallows Hill, where many martyrs were put to death in 1692. Just before reading the inner tale, he provided background on witchcraft delusion, "the dust of martyrs was beneath our feet" and announced they "stood on Gallows Hill" (*IX* 267). Added to this prior knowledge, the narrator brought material evidence to bridge the two times and spaces, as well as connecting the inner tale and outer narrative: "the wood-wax" covered over the hill. By informing to the ladies that "the wizard's grave was close beside us, and that the wood-wax had sprouted originally from his unhallowed bones" (*IX* 277), the historical witchcraft and

the imaginative tale would certainly have become connected. Although his performance was supposed to make the audience sufficiently aware of the connection with the past on the very spot of Gallows Hill, the result turned out differently than the narrator expected. After he had completed the inner tale, the ladies began to laugh as if they rejected the linkage between the historical past and their present. Then, the narrator "made a trial whether truth were more powerful than fiction" (*IX* 278) in his narrative space.

At this point, his twice-told style, which was just to retell the original manuscript as an inner story, began to shift the performative style to judge the reader's response in the space of the outer frame. Fueling his listeners' imagination, the narrator eloquently described the scene of when both victims and persecutors congregated on the hillside. Here, he was expected to retell the historical truth of the witch trials, but in fact, he went beyond the boundaries of discipline: he transgressed the limits of historical fact by plunging into his imagination with "a blacker horror, and a deeper woe," that is the act of emphasizing the incident too much for telling the truth.

At this moment, Hawthorne, intentionally or unintentionally, provided the technique of romance to "present the truth" under circumstances "of the writer's own choosing or creation" (*II* 1). Attempting to represent the truth about the historical witch trials, Hawthorne made his "trial" by fusing the historical elements with imaginary description, and he demonstrated the power of romance in front of the inside listeners and the outside readers as well. Stanley Brodwin points out that "Hawthorne concentrates on the value and force of history" in this narrative, and this influential power will convert "the human heart from one stage of being to another" that will be achieved only by "making people aware that they are witnesses … to the truth of events they have ignored, forgotten or psychologically repressed" (Brodwin 117). Hawthorne's final trial was to judge "whether truth were more powerful than fiction," and this "truth" is not only the historical fact but the long repressed truth from the public. As the best way to set the authorized history free from the social oppression, Hawthorne tried to make both internal audience and the external readers of the text become witnesses to the event through the

simulated experience. To become "the witness" of the past event, though it is impossible to re-experience one's life practically, Hawthorne might have deliberately once failed to read the inner tale, but then had a chance to retell the event using the power of romance. When the narrator's companions both seized his arms with their nerves "trembling" and tears welled up in their eyes, his trial was over as "now the past had done all it could" (*IX* 280).[10] This ending is a somewhat assertive way indeed, but his narrative technique strongly affects their bodies and hearts enough to shake with fright, thus his new form of narrative performance could demonstrates much more power than mere fiction or simple historical fact.

Having failed to present publish the original manuscript in public before, Hawthorne was able to reuse that surviving tale in his revised version. Then, he made it fail to be retold as the inner text again, so he repeated to fail to retell the original "Alice Doane." However, he reused that failure as a foothold and could go beyond the boundary of narrative frame to tell "the truth" and that must be his "appeal" to have revised it as the updated version. Even though the tale of "Alice Doane's Appeal" is criticized for being fragmented and having a patched construction, it succeeds in making the audience witnesses to both the historical event and the moment when the style of romance was born. Young Hawthorne tried to appeal to his readers about the problems lurking behind history, but that could not be re-presented just by retelling the facts. It was in need of a different form of narrative. In this sense, "Alice Doane's Appeal" is the critical narrative point which generated the romance, and has become a prototype of his well-known style of romance.

Conclusion

Being retold, twice or more times, a difference in time is inevitably generated between the first tale and the retold one. In the case of "Alice Doane's Appeal," though the original manuscript of "Alice Doane" written around 1825 was mostly destroyed, some parts had survived and were integrated into the new frame of narrative about ten years later. In fact, there were two levels of audience to the text: "two young ladies" within the story, and contemporary

readers of the magazine. Those readers could make a response to the tale immediately after the tale was issued, thus their reaction had a good chance to reach the author, Hawthorne, directly or indirectly, and it was possible to make mutual interaction. In addition to the contemporary readers, another level of audience are constantly generated as long as the tale is republished and reappears in this modern world. The future generations including present readers will make it possible to offer new interpretations of the works, broadly taking a panoramic perspective of the American society that transcends eras.

Before leaving Gallows Hill, the narrator made additional comments at the end of the story to the external readers "we." He deeply regretted that "there is nothing on its barren summit, …, to assist the imagination in appealing to the heart," and suggested as follows:

> We build the memorial column on the height which our fathers made sacred with their blood, poured out in a holy cause. And here in dark, funereal stone, should rise another monument, sadly commemorative of the errors of an earlier race, and not to be cast down, while the human heart has one infirmity that may result in crime. (*IX* 280)

While witchcraft in 1692 was identified with the real space of Gallows Hill in Salem and it was a hard historical fact, the public had not deservingly accepted nor corrected the error of their fathers up to the Hawthorne's day. "Another monument," therefore, using dark funereal stone should be needed to commemorate their ancestors' historical errors so that the beholders could imagine the past misdeeds. To construct a monument as material evidence is one form of commemoration of the past, which will stimulate the imagination of future generations. His narrative style, romance, must be another monument which imbues the historical fact into the fictional form to illustrate the truth of the event. One characteristic of romance is that it has a self-generating power by being reassessed and reconstructed repeatedly by readers based on the social contexts in which they live. By re-interpreting the narrative continuously, his romance will provide a chance to reconsider the past in just

the same way as a monument constructed of dark funereal stone.

After producing many short tales, Hawthorne moved on to write long fictions, and each title or subtitle contains the term "Romance": *The House of the Seven Gables: A Romance* (1851), *The Scarlet Letter: A Romance* (1850), *The Blithedale Romance* (1852), and *The Marble Faun: or, The Romance of Monte Beni* (1860). He found literature a unique means of working through the oppressed past, and acknowledged that this is only possible in his narrative space or Romance, which can often change mere historical facts to other interpretations. That is his privileged space of Romance, and this special space demands an agreement between author and audience. By printing "Romance" clearly on the front cover, Hawthorne secures an agreement from his audience that they are all entering an imaginary space when they open the book. For Hawthorne, retelling the narrative is a performative act that makes the audience reinhabit the imaginary space of the past, and gives a chance to reconsider unresolved historical events. Thus, his "twice-told" style is not a "tedious" repetition, but contains the manifest intention to connect the past to the present across the borders of historical time as well as narrative space.

Notes

*This work was supported by JSPS KAKENHI Grant Number JP16K02522.

[1] All citations from Nathaniel Hawthorne's works identified by volume and page numbers in the text, refer to the *Centenary Edition*. By calculating the time gap, it might become "two hundred and twenty three year," of course.

[2] The works of "The Gentle Boy"(1832), "The Gray Champion"(1835), "The May-Pole of Merry Mount" (1836), "My Kinsman, Major Molineux"(1832), and "Roger Malvin's Burial"(1832) were planned to be recorded in the so-called *Provincial Tales,* but Hawthorne aborted this plan. All these works are set in the colonial period before the War of Independence, underling how Hawthorne intended to use the historical elements put into his narrative from his early years. See Gale, *Nathaniel Hawthorne encyclopedia* (340-41, 427-28,

541-42).

[3] Other than Hawthorne, many American writers treat the history of seventeenth-century New England

such as James Kirke Paulding, James Fenimore Cooper, Catharine Maria Sedgwick, Eliza Buckminster Lee. For the former argument , see Bell ix-xi, Buell 74.

[4] Nina Baym points out that before 1850, when Hawthorne began to claim repeatedly that he was writing romances rather than novels, the genre of romance was not seriously considered by the public. She also asserts, "Hawthorne in his own day was seen neither as the romance writer he claimed to be, nor as the essentially representative writer he has come to be" as he longed to be. However, it is significant to know that the concept of "how the idea of American romance now controlling so much American literary study" is not a long-term discussion but "a recent invention" (443).

[5] In the same manner, *Mosses from an Old Manse* was first published in 1846, then three more pieces were added to the second edition in 1854. His final collection of the tales in his lifetime named *The Snow-Image and Other Twice-Told Tales* was released in late 1851, then with copyright of 1852. This last collection contains his early works such as "The Wives of the Dead" (1832) and one of the works popular even today "My Kinsman, Major Molineux" (1832). Thus, these collections had appeared repeatedly in publications more than twice within twenty years.

[6] Nevertheless, Horatio Bridge criticized this title in the letter to Hawthorne in that "the stories are 'Twice-Told; and this I know from remarks of some of my friends, who declined buying because the book was not original."

[7] The second appearance of "Alice Doane's Appeal" is in *The Snow-Image Uncollected Tales, The Centenary Edition IX* (1974). *Seven Tales of My Native Land* was supposed to be published together with another salvaged tale "The Hollow of the Three Hills" (1830, later included in *Twice-Told Tales* in 1837) and "An Old Woman's Tale" (1830), both of which had once appeared in *Salem Gazette*, with some new stories added to this collection, but this arrangement had been canceled. According to Waggoner, Hawthorne himself

refers, in the frame of "Alice Doane's Appeal, " to the fact that the tale he read to his listeners was one of "a series written years ago," most of which had "fed the flames" (Waggoner 49).

[8] Douglas Robinson and Mary K. Ventura try to investigate the narrative structure in order to distinguish between correlation and causation in those two sections. Seymour L. Gross also points out that "this is the only story which is *told about* rather than *told*" because Hawthorne's revisional technique diminishes the attractiveness of its dramatic nature by using the "preponderance of summarization" within the tale (Gross 234). As Waggoner points out, there are a number of interruptions, falters and ambiguities. He said: "Certain portions of the tale which he read are quoted in the sketch; the rest is incompletely summarized, with the transitions between the quoted fragments managed by such expressions as 'I read on, and … described'; "by this fantastic piece of description … I intended to throw a ghostly glimmer round the reader; and "I dare not give the remainder of the scene" (49).

[9] For details of the quoted parts from "Alice Doane" and interpretation about the relationship between sin and ground, see Komiyama in 2006.

[10] Many critics recognize that the narrator's performance has sexual connotations. As Mary K. Ventura points out, the narrator's excessive performance seems not just to "tell" the story, but to "mesmerize" his young audience with his "seductive act" of storytelling (Ventura 32, 37). Person also reads his final act as "a metafictional workshop" to experiment with "author-audience" relations, especially with "the male artist's power over female response" (Person 134).

Works Cited

Baym, Nina. "Concepts of the Romance in Hawthorne's America." *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, vol.38, no.4, 1984, pp. 426-43.

Bell, Michael Davitt. *Hawthorne and the Historical Romance of New England*, 1971.

Brodwin, Stanley. "Hawthorne and the Function of History: A Reading of 'Alice

Doane's Appeal.'" *Nathaniel Hawthorne Journal*, vol. 4, 1974, pp.116-28.

Buell, Lawrence. "Hawthorne and the Problem of 'American' Fiction: The Example of *The Scarlet Letter*." *Hawthorne and the Real: Bicentennial Essays,* edited by Millicent Bell, Ohio State UP, 2005, pp. 40-69.

Chase, Richard. *The American Novel and its Tradition*. Doubleday Anchor Books, 1957.

Crews, Frederick C. *The Sins of the Fathers: Hawthorne's Psychological Themes*. Oxford UP, 1966.

Gale, Robert L. *A Nathaniel Hawthorne encyclopedia*. Greenwood P, 1991.

Gross, Seymour L. "Hawthorne's 'Alice Doane's Appeal.'" *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, vol. 10, no. 3, 1955, pp.232-36.

Hawthorne, Julian. *Nathaniel Hawthorne and His Wife: A Biography* I. Houghton Mifflin, 1892.

Hawthorne, Nathaniel. The Centenary Edition of the Works of Nathaniel Hawthorne, general editor, William Charvat et al., Ohio State UP, 1962-97. 23 vols.

Vol. I, *The Scarlet Letter*. 1962.

Vol. II, *The House of the Seven Gables*. 1965.

Vol. IX, *Twice-Told Tales*. 1974.

Vol. IX, *The Snow-Image Uncollected Tales*, 1974.

Vol. XV, *The Letters, 1813-1843*. 1984.

Vol. XXI, *The English Notebooks, 1853-1856*. 1997.

Howe, Susan. *The Birth-mark: unsettling the wilderness in American literary history*. Wesleyan UP, 1993.

Komiyama, mamico. "The Narrative Technique of 'Alice Doane's Appeal' –The Germ of the Hawthorne's romantic Style." *Seikei Jinbun Kennkyu: Journal of the Graduate School of Humanities*, no. 14, 2006, pp.17-28.

Person, Leland S. "Hawthorne's Early Tales: Male Authorship, Domestic Violence, and Female Readers," *Hawthorne and the Real: Bicentennial Essays,* edited by Millicent Bell, Ohio State UP, 2005, pp. 125-43.

Robinson, Douglas. "Metafiction and Heartfelt Memory: Narrative Balance in 'Alice Doane's Appeal.' " ESQ, vol. 28, 1982, pp. 213-19.

Tatsumi, Takayuki. "Twice-Told review: Poe's reading of Twice-Told Tales," *The Geibun-Kenkyu: Journal of Arts and Letters*, vol. 58, 1990, pp. 227-42.

Ventura, Mary K. " 'Alice Doane's Appeal': The Seducer Revealed." *ATQ*, vol.10, no.1, 1996, pp. 23-39.

Waggoner, Hyatt H. *Hawthorne: A Critical Study*. The Belknap P of Harvard UP, 1963.

Wineapple, Brenda. *Hawthorne: A Life.* Random House, 2004.